Preparatory School Gifted EFL Students' Mastery of Critical Reading Skills: An Evaluative Study

Faiza Moustafa Mohamed, Abdullah Mahmoud Ismail, Sahar Hassan Abdel Aziz
Faculty of Education, Sohag University, Egypt
DOI:

Abstract

This study aimed at evaluating preparatory school gifted EFL students' mastery of critical reading skills. Participants of the present study consisted of twenty-second-year prep stage students at Al-Gadeeda Preparatory School. The design of the study is the analytical evaluative approach. The study group was tested to examine the preparatory school gifted EFL students' mastery of critical reading skills. The instruments of the study included a critical reading test and interviews with students. Data were collected by interviews, observation, and a critical reading test. Gifted students have special abilities different from those of the ordinary students, so they are expected to have high levels of critical reading skills. However, the results of the study revealed the low level of the second prep-year gifted EFL students in the critical reading skills. Therefore, innovative approaches must be encouraged and implemented to improve critical reading skills among second prep-year EFL gifted students.

Key words: Gifted Students, Critical Reading.

Introduction

The learning process no longer refers to just the students’ acquisition of a series of knowledge, skills, attitudes; it has become a process of modification, and comprehensive and profound change of behavior. Many students, including the gifted, fail to live up to their potential. There can be many reasons for this failure, one of which is the way in which the students are taught and, often, assessed at schools does not enable them to learn in an appropriate way.

Reading, especially critical reading, has always been considered as a challenging skill by many EFL students. It refers to students’ thinking about what they read, assessing what they have read, and using their own judgment about what they have read. According to Hudson (2007), critical reading enables students to analyze, synthesize, and evaluate what is read. There is a need for developing critical reading so that students become able to navigate their ways in manipulating knowledge and judging its validity, credibility, and applicability in local settings. Wallace (2003) also, illustrates that critical reading provides students the opportunity to think about, analyze the information critically, and be able to look at the context with a wider viewpoint linked to their critical understanding and getting the chance to evaluate the context they face.
Despite the importance of critical reading, it is not given adequate consideration in EFL settings. Research literature carries evidence that foreign language students lack necessary skills for reading adequately in foreign language reading settings and appropriate abilities to critically process input offered to them. Kamal (2010) illustrates that the lack of teaching EFL critical reading at the Egyptian schools is because of emphasizing surface-level information processing techniques such as memorization and rehearsal and losing the chance for performing reading tasks which involve higher order thinking skill such as hypothesizing, synthesizing, comparing/contrasting, applying, and evaluating.

Being a teacher of English, the researcher observed that a due attention was not given to critical reading skills despite their great importance, and students in the Egyptian preparatory stage lack the skills needed to read critically in English. They are unable to analyze and evaluate what they read. They cannot identify main ideas in reading selections. They have difficulty in distinguishing between facts and opinions and are incapable of identifying the author's purpose, viewpoint, and tone. This inefficiency in EFL critical reading skills of preparatory stage students may be due to the lack of practice in terms of critical reading in Egyptian schools.

Researchers investigated the prevalence of problems related to students' low levels in the critical reading skills at the Egyptian context. In his study, Husein (2007) found that there is a problem concerning the talented students' critical reading skills. It tried to develop the students' critical reading skills using a suggested program based on the Reception Theory. Ahmed (2012) pointed out that despite the importance of critical reading, many students lack these skills, especially EFL students. Similar conclusions were revealed in studies by Lasheen (2012), Abdullah (2012) and Youssif (2014).

Moreover, from the researcher's review of the EFL courses of the students at the preparatory stage and her interviews with preparatory stage teachers and inspectors of English, she has concluded that the EFL course is insufficient to satisfy the needs and the abilities of the gifted students. Students in the preparatory schools have some difficulties with the critical reading skills. Such problem is more intricate with EFL gifted students. They have potential capabilities, which have not been adequately unleashed in the current learning environments.

**Context of the problem**

The study attempted to answer the following question:

How Based on the previous introduction, pertinent studies (Husein 2007; Kamal 2010; Abdullah 2012; Ahmed 2012; Lasheen 2012; and Youssif 2014) and the researcher's own observations as an expert teacher, it has been clear that there is a problem in second year gifted EFL students' critical reading. This problem may be due to the conventional methods and practices followed by most EFL preparatory stage teachers.
Questions of the study
- Effective is the performance of preparatory stage gifted EFL students in the critical reading skills?

Definition of Terms
Gifted Students
The researcher in the current study adopts Sternberg and Grigorenko (2007)’s definition of gifted students. Gifted students are those who have "high-integrated set of abilities needed to attain success in life; these abilities are analytical, creative, and practical abilities" (P.30).

Critical Reading
Critical reading is “reading in which the reader reacts critically to what he or she is reading, through relating the content of a reading material to personal standards, values, attitudes or beliefs, i.e., going beyond what is said in the text and critically evaluating the relevancy and value of what is read” (Richards & Schmidt 2010: 134).

Critical reading skills are operationally defined in the present study as a process for evaluating what is read. It involves the ability to differentiate fact from opinion ability to identify the main idea, making Inference, identifying similarities and differences, drawing conclusion, identifying cause and effect relationship, and recognizing the author's point of view. The gifted students’ scores in the critical reading test measure it.

Review of Literature
Critical reading is a reading process that involves critical thinking. It is a sophisticated skill that enables students to discover more information and ideas within the text. King, Ellinger and Wolf (1967, cited in Guzzetti 2002) defined it as "an analytical and evaluative process that requires the reader to make rational judgments about both the content and style of writing based upon valid criteria’ (P 114). Thus, when students begin reading critically, they don’t just read to get information, but they read as Wallace (2003) illustrates, to perform a mental action on the word-form and make connections between the context of the text and students’ personal knowledge to infer the meanings of words and to evaluate the context they face.

Pirozzi (2003) defines critical reading as a “very-high level comprehension of written material requiring interpretation and evaluation skill and it also entails using reference to go beyond what is stated explicitly, filling in informational gaps, and coming to logical conclusions” (P. 325). Critical reading involves assessing and judging the value of what is read. Reading critically can be illustrated as a conversation with an author, talking back to an author in our imagination. It arouses students' abilities to predict, compare, evaluate, and make decisions (Abu Shihab 2011).

Bosley (2008, cited in Sarikaya 2018) states that critical reading is a purposeful and conscious activity through which the reader communicates with the text on meta-cognitive level and proceeds to make sense of it and to reconstruct it in his mind. Wallace and Wray (2011) indicate that it is a very active process and students cannot
avoid being affected by your own expectation, prejudices and previous knowledge, which formulate and deepen their recognition and enjoying of what is read.

**Characteristics of a critical reader**

Critical reading is a way of reading that requires that students take a deeper look at what they read. Students are encouraged to rely on their natural curiosity to ask relevant questions to the read topic - in other words, to become active rather than passive. Moreover, it is an acquired skill which can be developed with some knowledge and experience. Thus, it can be said that to read critically means to read analytically; to question and to think. The student who possesses good critical reading skills can go “beyond the information given . . . by asking questions, making hypotheses, seeking evidence, and validating assumptions” (Langer 1990, cited in Marschall & Davi 2012).

A critical reader can see the connections between topics and use knowledge from other disciplines to enhance their reading and learning experience. Personally, a critical reader is expected to see controversies existing in the area and be able to judge the validity of the author’s conclusion in the light of the evidence presented.

**The importance of critical reading instruction**

Critical reading is one of the important language skills associated with critical thinking. It is important to the reader because it is related to the formation of knowledge and the building of personality, through which the student develops his desires, tendencies, and attitudes in the era of rapid change, characterized by cognitive explosion. It has become a necessity for students, as it provides them with important ideas for problem solving, so that their minds are motivated to think and meditate and consequently raises their level of comprehension and understanding of social issues and problems.

Critical reading implies having the ability to evaluate and judge what is read according to a series of criteria and Standards (Strang 2001). McClain (1985) pointed out that critical reading skills include reading material with an alert and questioning mind, comparing and contrasting what has been read, considering the author's viewpoint and being aware of other viewpoints, detecting propaganda techniques, identifying relevant and irrelevant information and differentiating fact from opinion.

Critical reading aims at encouraging students to think while reading. It helps students in being competent in the technological revolution era and to cope with the expansion of knowledge and information which requires a critical reader. Paul and Elder (2008), illustrate that critical reading is the art and science of evaluating and analyzing a text. In a similar vein, Oliver as, Marquez and Sanmarti (2014) illustrate that teaching reading at school enables students to analyze information critically and apply the knowledge they have acquired at different situations. Thus, according to Jones (2002), critical reading not only empowers students in EFL learning skills such as vocabulary
and reading, but also teaches them how to reach real understanding of texts and how to think about them with a critical view.

Critical reading is very important in both academic and everyday lives. Harris and Hodges (1991, as cited in Mitsikopoulo 2015) illustrates that it is a process of making judgments in reading evaluating relevancy and adequacy of what is read. According to Wallace (2003) critical reading gives students the chance to think about and analyze the information critically. Thus, they can look at the context with a wider viewpoint based on their critical understanding and can evaluate the context they face. However, teachers give little attention to the critical reading skills. Thus, many students become unable to develop adequate critical reading skills (Abd Kadir, Subki, Jamal, and Ismail 2014). While the education of critical reading is so much important, it is a must to inspect which methods are in use for teaching critical reading.

Identification of the gifted

Gifted students have many distinctive characteristics. They are characterized by their keen observation, their fast pace of learning, their creative and productive thinking. They can understand the new ideas very easily and they investigate all the details involved when solving a certain problem. They have different learning needs from those of their age peers; therefore, they need special educational planning to support them in developing their potential. They need a challenging curriculum that meets their needs. They also need instructional practices and learning methods that satisfy their potentials and needs.

Identification of the gifted students is no easy task as numerous perspectives have been proposed in the earliest use of this word. Traditionally, giftedness was identified by means of IQ tests often built around a general (g) factor of intelligence. "The earliest use of this word to identify high ability students was by Lewis Terman in 1925" (Manning 2006: 65), and the Stanford-Binet IQ test is an example of such tests (Gallagher 2008) As stated by Erisen et al., (2016) that “traditionally, students with superior high intellectual or academic ability (gifted) are identified as those who score very high on intelligence tests and who exceptionally do well on achievement measures” (P. 553).

Critical reading and gifted students

Critical reading has been defined by authors and researchers in several ways. Marschall and Davis (2012) defined it as a process through which students infer meaning from a text. It enables students to question, hypothesize, and search for evidence and confirmation, so they can go beyond the information given in a text. They also, react critically to what they read. Critical reading is also, a sophisticated comprehension skill, as when students read, they go beyond the literal interpretation of what they read. Richards and Schmidt (2010) add that in critical reading, students relate the content of what they read to their own experiences, values,
morals, attitudes, or beliefs, and evaluate critically the relevancy and value of what is read. They also, read to react with the writer and consequently they accept or reject his/her ideas. Critical reading teaches students how to reach real understanding of texts and how to think about them with a critical view, in other words critical reading prompts students to think while reading. Thus, this kind of reading requires posing and answering questions about the text and the author. In their everyday life, students sometimes want to cope with complicated public and political issues, make decisions, give opinions, and solve problems. To do such things effectively, students have to be capable of evaluating what they see, hear, and read. Therefore, Abd Kadir, Subki, Jamal and Ismail (2014) see that it is important for teachers to teach the critical reading skills to students as these skills could help students to survive when they leave school and start their practical life.

Gifted students have exceptional ability in reading; however, they need more practice on how to utilize higher order thinking to broaden their critical reading skills. Critical reading enables gifted readers to distinguish relevant from irrelevant information, make inferences, formulate interpretations, realize the implications, examine consequences, look at the authentic language of the text, analyze actions and assumptions, take multiple perspectives, and evaluate the evidence and the text itself. Reading programs for the gifted should consider the individual characteristics of the children, capitalize on the gifts they possess, and expand and challenge their abilities. Tasks should be commensurate with ability and achievement.

**The critical reading skills**

The CRS helps students to be able to analyze, synthesize, and evaluate what is read. Teaching the critical reading skills to students may lead them to be critical thinkers; choose or reject the ideas put forward, agree, or disagree with the issues, and most important of all they know the reason(s) why they do it. Teaching students to read critically will lead them to be critical thinker. Consequently, this will produce better school leavers who can survive in the real world (Hudson 2007).

Based on the literature, there are no definite sub-skills of CR. Manarin, Carey, Rathburn and Ryland (2015: 4) illustrate that critical reading involves the following key skills; identifying patterns of textual elements, distinguishing between main and subordinate ideas, evaluating credibility, making judgments about how a text is argued, and making relevant inferences about the text.

Abdel Moaty (2002) asserted that the most important critical reading skills are identifying the main idea, making inferences, identifying cause and effect relationship, drawing conclusions, distinguishing between facts and opinions, and making comparisons. Moreover, Abdullah (1998) identified nine core sub-skills. They are sequenced from the easiest to the most difficult as follows: identifying similarities and differences,
evaluating inductive inferences, identifying facts and opinions, evaluating generalizations, evaluating strength of arguments, identifying biased statements, identifying relevant and irrelevant materials, identifying the author's motives, and recognizing hidden assumptions.

Based upon the recommendations of the previous studies and the related research Abdel Moaty, 2002; Manarin, Carey, Rathburn and Ryland, 2015, the national standards for teaching English as a foreign language set by the National Authority for Quality Assurance and Accreditation of Education (Abdelrasoul 2014) and the objectives of teaching EFL at the preparatory stage set by the Ministry of Education (Chilton 2016).

The instructional strategies of teaching critical reading

Reading critically plays an important role in students’ success. Students analyze, synthesize, and evaluate what is read. Moreover, to read critically, EFL students should be given the chance to go through the text and focus on the author’s assumptions, viewpoints, purposes, and ideology. Sousa (2014) illustrates the following strategies for teaching the CRS which aims to encourage and develop students’ critical reading ability:

Previewing: It implies "Learning about a text before reading it". Students’ learning about the text before really reading it and guessing the topic from the heading and subheadings; this can be done through skimming the text to get an overview of the content and its organization, and identifying the rhetorical situation, activating prior knowledge, building connections, establishing goals for reading with purpose,

Contextualizing: it implies placing a text in its historical, biographical, and cultural contexts and includes making inferences and synthesizing. When students read a text, they read it through the lens of their own experiences, values, and attitudes.

Questioning: Students ask questions about the content of the text. Teachers can quiz them on the main topic. Teachers ask relevant and appropriately phrased questions designed to help students understand the reading text and respond to it more effectively and efficiently, (Willis 2008; Camden 2009).

Reflecting: Students examine their personal responses and reflect on challenges to their personal beliefs and values.

Outlining and summarizing students identify the main ideas and restate them in their own words. Summarizing is a valuable way to check understanding of the text. Outlining and summarizing enable students to distinguish between the main ideas and the supporting ideas and examples (Willis 2008; Camden 2009).

Evaluating an argument: It is important to note that evaluating an argument implies not only a disagreement with the author. It implies testing the logic of the text as well as its credibility and emotional impact, students are often asked to determine fact and opinion, find cause and effect relationships, determine claim and support,
determine premise and conclusion, and finally analyze, interpret, and argue about the text. Comparing and contrasting: It implies exploring the similarities and differences in texts for a better understanding.

**How to teach critical reading**

Critical reading is an interactive process at which readers actively engage with texts, it is also, a reaction between the text and the student’s experience. To teach students how to read critically, it is necessary to encourage students to question, predict and organize their thoughts in order to create new ideas. Tomasek (2009) argues that students can critically read in a variety of ways:

- When they raise vital questions and problems from the text,
- When they gather and assess relevant information and then offer plausible interpretations of that information,
- When they test their interpretations against previous knowledge or experience and current experience,
- When they examine their assumptions and the implications of those assumptions, and
- When they use what they have read to communicate effectively with others or to develop potential solutions to complex problems (P 127).

Critical reading practices give more control to the students in classroom practices. In other words, the students are expected to contribute with their own experiences, opinions, criticisms, while in the context of this study, student contribution is limited to language practice in traditional reading classes.

**Design of the study**

The design of the study is the evaluative study design (N = 20). The pilot study was conducted at Al-Gadeeda Preparatory School Prep School for Girls in Sohag.

**Participants of the study**

The researcher chose the participants of the study from the second year-prep students at one of the public prep schools in Sohag Governorate, Al-Gadeeda Preparatory School Prep School for Girls in Sohag. Selection of the participants was based on the following criteria:

1. Teachers’ nominations based on the premise that a teacher's knowledge of each student's ability and potential is likely to be substantial.
2. English language achievement test grades at their last year final exam > 90%
3. Overall English language proficiency test score > 90% (developed by the researcher)

**Instrument of the study**

To achieve the objective of study, the researchers developed a critical reading test. To investigate the problem among the EFL gifted students, the researcher applied the critical reading skills test to determine the levels of preparatory second-year gifted students in the critical reading skills. The questions tested the following skills: identifying similarities and differences, drawing conclusion,
identifying cause and effect relationship, and recognizing the author's point of view. The results are shown in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measured critical reading skills</th>
<th>Maximum score</th>
<th>Average score</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Ability to differentiate fact from opinion</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>64 %</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Identify the main idea</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>75 %</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Making Inference</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>70 %</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Identifying similarities and differences</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>70 %</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Drawing conclusions</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>65 %</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Identifying cause and effect relationship</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>63 %</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Recognizing the author's point of view</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>68 %</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>26</strong></td>
<td><strong>17.55</strong></td>
<td><strong>68 %</strong></td>
<td><strong>20</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gifted students have special abilities different from those of the ordinary students, so they are expected to have high levels of critical reading skills. However, the results as shown in the previous table depict low levels of critical reading skills among a sample of gifted students at Al-Gadeeda Preparatory School (N = 20).

In order to find the information regarding to the students’ problem when they read, the researcher needed to conduct an interview. The researcher used interview guide to get the data deeply. Interview was conducted by the researcher only after having results from the critical reading test, which revealed the students' weaknesses in the critical reading skills (ability to differentiate fact from opinion, identify the main idea, identify the main idea, making inference, identifying similarities and differences, drawing conclusions, identifying cause and effect relationship, and recognizing the author's point of view). Interviews were also conducted with EFL teachers and supervisors. Data were also collected via the researcher's observation.

**Findings of the Study**

The problem of this study was determined in the low level of second year EFL gifted prep students in some critical reading skills as shown in the results of the pilot study. This might be attributed to many factors. One of these factors is the approaches and practices that most EFL prep stage teachers follow in teaching critical reading skills, may be one of the reasons of such low level.

When teaching reading in schools, teachers concentrate on teaching students how to discriminate shapes and patterns, and phonics and word recognition skills. Thus, students will only read but rarely use their cognitive ability to interact with the text and try to analyze it. If students are exposed to this type of reading skill all the time, it is difficult for them to be critical readers and if this happens the teaching of reading is more on just sounding and recognizing.
English words. The students’ lack of practicing let them face difficulty in using the critical reading skills. Students mentioned that they need more on the critical reading skills. This reveals that there is an urgent need to develop instructional programs to satisfy the needs of students, especially the gifted and the talented. Critical reading skills should be taught to students because if we neglect teaching these skills, students will not be able to think outside of the box and they might become passive learners, always agreeing to the ideas in the text given to them. We want students who could challenge the writer's view/s and come out with valid and sound arguments. We do not want them to be submissive readers all the time.

Countries must give more interest to the design of instructional programs for the gifted as they represent the human treasure that every country must discover, unleash and invest for the advancement of the human and financial resources. This must be initiated by discovering the gifted and talented first and then finding the appropriate ways to provide them the suitable support to nurture their skills and abilities. Considering the mentioned above, it can be said that one of the main axes of the school reform process in our country is the interest in the gifted students.

**Recommendations**

- Educational and psychological modern theories that deal with the gifted should be applied in the field of English language teaching. For example, the successful intelligence theory can be applied in the field of the English language teaching (represented critical reading skills) for the gifted students of the preparatory stage.
- It is necessary to develop enrichment programs for the gifted students in Egypt to develop the four skills of English language; namely, reading, writing, speaking and listening, to assess the effectiveness of enrichment programs in developing the four skills in different study stages.
- It is necessary to take care of the learning environment of the gifted students. The non-threatening environment encourages students to express their thoughts and ideas without apprehension. More emphasis should be given to focus group work inside the classroom instead of the traditional way of teaching. In addition, teachers should promote creative thinking by having students select their own topics for papers or presentations, choose their own ways to solve problems, and re-choose if they find that errors were their choices.
- Gifted students require instruction and scaffolding for their learning but may not require the level of repetition and support needed by other less able students. They must give students the opportunity to read utilizing higher order thinking skills. They should encourage their students to show a greater interest in critical reading. They have to put
into consideration the individual differences among the students. EFL Teachers should be aware of the importance of enhancing the student-centered learning contexts. The role of EFL teacher should be changed from being a dominant figure in the classroom to be a facilitator, encourager, advisor and organizer. Reading clubs should be established in schools to enhance students' critical reading.

- It is important that foreign language instruction put into consideration that high abilities are necessary but not enough for outstanding achievement or for the development of giftedness.

**Suggestions for Further Research**

- Investigating EFL gifted prep students' critical reading skills in different stages.
- More studies are required to examine how effective is EFL gifted prep students' creative reading skills.

**Conclusion**

The low level of second prep EFL gifted prep students in some critical reading skills as shown in the results of the pilot study. This might be attributed to many factors. One of these factors is the approaches and practices that most EFL prep stage teachers follow in teaching critical reading skills. This provokes the need for developing instructional programs such as enrichment programs based on the successful intelligent theory to help solve such problem. Thus, researchers are asked to examine the effectiveness of the successful intelligent theory-based enrichment programs in developing second-year EFL gifted prep students' critical reading skills.

**References**


Doi:10.5539/ass.v7n8p209


Marschall S. & Davis C., 2012. A Conceptual Framework for Teaching Critical Reading to Adult College Students, Adult Learning 23 (2), 63-68.


